

Université Lumière Lyon 2

Faculté des Sciences Economiques

Sources of Errors and Biases in Traffic Forecasts for Toll Road Concessions

Thèse pour le Doctorat ès Sciences Economiques

Mention Economie des Transports

Antonio NUNEZ

dirigée par M. le Professeur Alain BONNAFOUS

Présentée et soutenue publiquement le
5 décembre 2007.

Membres du Jury:

| | | |
|------------------------|---------------------------------|-------------------|
| M. Alain BONNAFOUS | Pr. à l'IEP de Lyon | <i>Directeur</i> |
| M. Yves CROZET | Pr. à l'Université Lyon 2 | |
| M. Jean DELONS | Chargé de Mission à Cofiroute | |
| M. Fabien LEURENT | Pr. à l'ENPC | |
| M. Werner ROTHENGATTER | Pr. à l'Université de Karlsruhe | <i>Rapporteur</i> |
| M. Stéphane SAUSSIER | Pr. à l'Université de Paris 11 | <i>Rapporteur</i> |

Contents

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Acknowledgements | 11 |
| Abstract | 13 |
| Résumé | 19 |
| Introduction | 27 |
| Plan of the Manuscript | 29 |
| 1 Errors and Biases in Transport Demand Forecasts | 33 |
| 1.1 What is Forecasting? | 35 |
| 1.2 Forecasting in Transport | 36 |
| 1.2.1 The Classic 4-step Model | 38 |
| 1.3 Errors in Traffic Forecasts | 39 |
| 1.4 Sources of Errors | 41 |
| 1.4.1 Uncertainty About the Future | 42 |
| 1.4.2 Methodology, Assumptions and Data | 43 |
| 1.4.3 Behavioural Sources | 46 |
| 1.4.4 The Particular Case of Road Concessions | 49 |
| 1.5 Objectives of this Research | 51 |
| 2 Transport Forecasters' Behaviour and Overconfidence | 55 |
| 2.1 Introduction | 56 |
| 2.2 Who Forecasts Transport Demand? | 57 |
| 2.3 The Latest Forecast | 61 |
| 2.4 Models | 63 |
| 2.5 Forecast Errors | 66 |
| 2.5.1 Sources of Errors | 67 |

| | | |
|----------|--|------------|
| 2.6 | Forecast's Environment | 68 |
| 2.7 | Overconfidence in Transport Forecasts | 72 |
| 2.8 | Econometric Analysis of Biases | 76 |
| 2.9 | Comments Uncommented | 77 |
| 2.10 | Conclusions | 78 |
| 3 | Winner's Curse in Toll Road Concessions | 83 |
| 3.1 | Introduction | 85 |
| 3.2 | Auctions for Toll Road Concessions | 90 |
| 3.2.1 | First-Price, Sealed-Bid Auctions | 90 |
| 3.2.2 | Common Value Auctions | 90 |
| 3.2.3 | Auctions with Differing Levels of Common Uncertainty | 92 |
| 3.2.4 | Renegotiation in Toll Road Concessions | 94 |
| 3.3 | Bidding for Toll Road Concessions: A Simple Model | 96 |
| 3.3.1 | Model Framework | 96 |
| 3.3.2 | Model Setting | 97 |
| 3.3.3 | Number of Bidders and Traffic Forecast Deviation | 99 |
| 3.3.4 | Number of Bidders and Level of Common Uncertainty | 100 |
| 3.3.5 | Number of Bidders and Renegotiation | 101 |
| 3.4 | Data on Road Concession Contract Auctions | 103 |
| 3.4.1 | Dependent Variable: Traffic Forecast Deviation | 103 |
| 3.4.2 | Explanatory Variables | 104 |
| 3.5 | Econometric Results | 107 |
| 3.6 | Robustness Analysis | 109 |
| 3.7 | Conclusions | 111 |
| 4 | Decreasing Long-Term Traffic Growth | 119 |
| 4.1 | Introduction | 121 |
| 4.2 | Traffic Growth | 122 |
| 4.3 | Why does Traffic Grow Decreasingly? | 124 |
| 4.4 | Econometric Issues | 127 |
| 4.4.1 | Partial Adjustment | 127 |
| 4.4.2 | Integrated variables, Cointegration and Error-Correction | 128 |
| 4.5 | Data and Estimation | 131 |
| 4.6 | Evidences of Decreasing Growth | 131 |

| | | |
|----------|--|------------|
| 4.6.1 | Cross-section Time Series Analysis | 132 |
| 4.6.2 | Testing for Parameter Stability | 134 |
| 4.6.3 | Moving Regressions | 136 |
| 4.7 | A Functional Form for Decreasing Elasticity | 137 |
| 4.7.1 | Impact on Long-Term Forecasts | 140 |
| 4.8 | Conclusions | 142 |
| 5 | Estimating the Value of Travel Time Savings | 147 |
| 5.1 | Introduction | 148 |
| 5.2 | The Value of Time in Transport | 151 |
| 5.2.1 | VTTS in Freight Transport | 154 |
| 5.3 | Discrete Choice Models | 155 |
| 5.3.1 | The Multinomial Logit | 155 |
| 5.3.2 | The Mixed Logit Model | 160 |
| 5.4 | Bayesian Procedures | 162 |
| 5.4.1 | Overview of Bayesian Concepts | 163 |
| 5.4.2 | Drawing from the Posterior | 165 |
| 5.4.3 | Posterior Mean as a Classical Estimator | 169 |
| 5.4.4 | Posteriors for the Mean and Variance | 170 |
| 5.4.5 | Hierarchical Bayes for Mixed Logit | 174 |
| 5.5 | Challenges in Estimating VTTS | 178 |
| 5.5.1 | Identifying Preference Heterogeneity | 178 |
| 5.5.2 | Selecting Random Parameters | 179 |
| 5.5.3 | Selecting the Distributions of the Random Parameters | 180 |
| 5.5.4 | Revealed Preference Data | 182 |
| 5.5.5 | Optimization Problems | 182 |
| 5.5.6 | Imposing Constraints | 182 |
| 5.5.7 | Priors | 183 |
| 5.5.8 | Advantages and Problems of Bayesian Procedures | 183 |
| 5.5.9 | The Role of the Alternative Specific Constant | 184 |
| 5.6 | The Survey | 185 |
| 5.7 | Econometric Results | 188 |
| 5.7.1 | Maximum Likelihood estimations | 188 |
| 5.7.2 | Bayesian Estimations | 189 |
| 5.8 | Discussion | 192 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| 5.9 Conclusions | 195 |
| General Conclusions and Policy Implications | 197 |
| A Forecasters' survey questions | 201 |
| B Distributions of variables in chapter 3 | 205 |
| C VTTS survey form | 211 |

List of Figures

| | | |
|------|--|----|
| 1 | Ecarts (réel/prévu) | 22 |
| 2 | Distribution de la valeur du temps PL. | 25 |
| 1.1 | Caricature of weather forecasts | 36 |
| 1.2 | Errors on Flyvbjerg et al (2006) sample | 40 |
| 1.3 | Errors variation over time on Flyvbjerg et al. (2003) sample | 40 |
| 1.4 | Errors on Standards and Poor's (2005) sample | 41 |
| 1.5 | Forecasting error in 49 road concessions (chapter 3 sample) | 41 |
| 1.6 | From "be" forecast to "do" forecast | 45 |
| 2.1 | In which country do you work?(N=178) | 57 |
| 2.2 | Location of the projects.(N=178) | 58 |
| 2.3 | Degree.(N=178) | 58 |
| 2.4 | Post-grad degree. (N=178) | 59 |
| 2.5 | Sectors forecasters work in.(N=178) | 59 |
| 2.6 | Gender distribution.(N=178) | 60 |
| 2.7 | Distributions of respondents' age. (N=178) | 60 |
| 2.8 | Number of forecasts.(N=178) | 61 |
| 2.9 | When did you prepare your latest forecast? (N=172). | 61 |
| 2.10 | Has the project been launched?(N=176) | 62 |
| 2.11 | Modes in the last forecast.(N=176) | 62 |
| 2.12 | Financing.(172) | 63 |
| 2.13 | Operation. (N=167) | 63 |
| 2.14 | Constant x Distributed VTTS. (N=153) | 64 |
| 2.15 | initial <i>versus</i> growth in demand forecasts. (N=162) | 64 |
| 2.16 | Aggregated or disaggregated modal share.(N=156) | 65 |
| 2.17 | Models forecasters apply. (N=170) | 65 |
| 2.18 | Stated error in the latest forecast.(N=88) | 66 |

| | | |
|------|---|-----|
| 2.19 | Perception of own's quality of results. (N=147) | 67 |
| 2.20 | Average distribution of under/overestimation.(N=150) | 67 |
| 2.21 | Forecasters under pressure. (N=168) | 69 |
| 2.22 | Would they produce better forecasts without pressure? (N=167) | 69 |
| 2.23 | Role of strategic manipulation.(N=155) | 70 |
| 2.24 | Sense of strategic manipulation.(N=134) | 70 |
| 2.25 | Influence of the technical study on the decision. (N=158) | 71 |
| 2.26 | Knowledge of the minimum demand level. (N=161) | 72 |
| 2.27 | Distributions of forecast errors. | 75 |
| 2.28 | Self-evaluation of competence level.(N=155) | 76 |
| 2.29 | Distributions of self-evaluations. | 77 |
| 3.1 | Length and Forecast Error. | 94 |
| 3.2 | TDF. | 104 |
| 3.3 | Number of Bidders. | 105 |
| 4.1 | From preferences to elasticity. | 126 |
| 4.2 | Traffic on the A10 motorway. | 132 |
| 4.3 | Traffic on the A11 motorway. | 132 |
| 4.4 | LTM long-run elasticities. | 133 |
| 4.5 | PAM long-run elasticities. | 133 |
| 4.6 | ECM long-run elasticities. | 134 |
| 4.7 | PAM short-run elasticities. | 134 |
| 4.8 | ECM short-run elasticities. | 135 |
| 4.9 | Comparing elasticities. | 138 |
| 4.10 | k versus traffic. | 139 |
| 4.11 | γ versus traffic. | 139 |
| 4.12 | A hypothetical example. | 141 |
| 4.13 | Application on the A11 motorway. | 141 |
| 5.1 | Comparison of VTTS distributions. | 152 |
| 5.2 | Survey's Location. | 186 |
| 5.3 | VTTS Distribution for empty and own account by ML | 191 |
| 5.4 | VTTS Distribution for loaded and hire by HB. | 192 |
| 5.5 | VTTS Distribution for empty and own account by HB. | 192 |
| 5.6 | VTTS Distribution for average load and hire dummies by HB. | 193 |

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| A.1 | Questions in the survey of forecaster's behaviour. | 203 |
| B.1 | TDF. | 207 |
| B.2 | Number of Bidders. | 207 |
| B.3 | Length. | 208 |
| B.4 | Civil Law. | 208 |
| B.5 | HIC. | 208 |
| B.6 | Public Information. | 209 |
| B.7 | Government Learning. | 209 |
| C.1 | VTTS survey form | 213 |

List of Tables

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 1.1 | Transport Modelling | 53 |
| 2.1 | Sources of errors. | 80 |
| 2.2 | Comparing ex-post and revealed errors | 81 |
| 2.3 | Comparing drivers and forecasters skilful | 81 |
| 2.4 | Impact of the main characteristics on self-evaluation. | 82 |
| 3.1 | Toll Road Concessions by Country and by Year | 114 |
| 3.2 | Data Definitions and Descriptive Statistics | 115 |
| 3.3 | Econometric results | 116 |
| 3.4 | Econometric results - extended | 117 |
| 4.1 | ADF test - exogenous variables | 129 |
| 4.2 | ADF test - traffic | 143 |
| 4.3 | Summary of descriptive statistics | 144 |
| 4.4 | CUSUM of squares test | 145 |
| 4.5 | Subsamples Elasticities | 146 |
| 5.1 | Sample and traffic count data | 187 |
| 5.2 | Final Sample | 187 |
| 5.3 | Summary of descriptive statistics | 188 |
| 5.4 | Econometric results | 194 |

Acknowledgements

Completing this doctoral work has been a wonderful and often overwhelming experience. Many people had some particular importance during the last three years, for their suggestions and work together but also for friendship and patience. I will however restrain this section to academic acknowledgments related to the thesis as a whole; chapters related particular acknowledgments are indicated in the beginning of each chapter.

I am deeply indebted to Jean Delons, who was the mentor of this thesis. His suggestions, opinions, discussions (sometimes about topics far from the heart of this thesis) were very useful and very appreciated.

I thank my supervisor, Alain Bonnafous, for giving me the freedom to study the topics I was more interested in, to Vincent Piron for proportioning the partnership between VINCI and the LET in which this research took place and to Yves Crozet, for his many helps in solving both theoretical and administrative problems.

I would like to thank Fabien Leurent, Werner Rothengatter and Stéphane Saussier for agree to participate to my thesis examination board.

Thanks to Infrastructure and Environment Department of the Inter-American Development Bank, where I had the opportunity to learn many different aspects of the transport economics applied to developing countries.

Thanks to Homero Neves, my co-author in a paper in which some of the topics studied here emerged. Also, I would like to thank Fernando Michel and Luis Senna, my former professors of transport economics, source of inspiration and motivation.

I thank Laure Athias, my co-author of a paper giving origin to my chapter

three, and chapter one of her PhD thesis, for the hours of discussions, many days of hard work, hundreds of phone calls and thousands of e-mails exchanged.

I gratefully acknowledge the support received from the ‘Cellule Economie et Trafic’ of Cofiroute, headed by Jean Delons. Thanks to Marie Dauchet, Melvyn Gaillac (whom prematurely passed away), Daniel Falaise and Michelle Bounegab (the sunniest office of Cofiroute).

Finally, I would like to thank my doctorate fellows, Louis Alligier, Julien Brunel, David Carrillo, Daniel Danau and Lisa Sutto. Their camaraderie was very appreciated.